

| Criteria  | Weighting | Status Quo | Social Enterprise | Arm's length unit | Comments   |
|---|-----------|------------|-------------------|-------------------|--|
| Independence i.e. impartiality  | 7         | 3          | 4                 | 3                 | Impartiality / neutrality is the most important aspect of the public library service. Also corresponds with an increasing expectation of gov't. that local gov't. will provide infrastructure for learning rather than the provision itself. |
| Freedom to act e.g. speed of decision making, choice of support services, flexibility in use of budgets | 9         | 1          | 4                 | 2                 | An independent organisation could make decisions much more quickly than current arrangements within the council. However, a new organisation could replicate some of the frustrations if not set up correctly.                               |
| Ability to deliver change e.g. handle tough decisions   | 8         | 1          | 2                 | 1                 | Likely to be easier in an independent organisation, although some caution needs to be added here: it depends on the way it was set up.   |
| Ability to form a clear and compelling vision   | 10        | 3          | 5                 | 4                 | Focus can currently be lost within corporate or directorate issues that have little impact on the individual service area. A clear business focus would deliver on specific Council Plan outcomes.   |
| Ability to bring in external investment   | 7         | 2          | 4                 | 2                 | YMT has attracted multi-million of additional resources from sources not open to CYC. There would be some similar potential here.  |
| Ability to be responsive e.g. to technology   | 10        | 2          | 3                 | 1                 | New IT arrangements needed e.g. ability to introduce new software quickly + more flexible practices in employment e.g. ability to appoint more swiftly and to have recruitment processes the enable a wider range of people to apply.        |
| Improved focus on business objectives   | 10        | 2          | 4                 | 2                 | Significant internal CYC distractions would be removed e.g. involvement in directorate and corporate issues that have no impact on the service.  |
| Creativity and innovation   | 10        | 1          | 3                 | 2                 | Current rigid CYC structures are a hindrance. E.g. Filtering on the public access IT and software development, recruitment of staff and facilities management.   |

|   |    |   |   |   |   |
|---|----|---|---|---|---|
| Entrepreneurialism                                | 10 | 1 | 5 | 2 | Empowering staff to be enterprising is key; the social enterprise ethos of profits invested back into the service likely to motivate staff, knowing they will see positive impacts and positive financial results being put back into their service.  |
| Culture   | 8  | 1 | 3 | 2 | Flexibility of staffing and building the right culture within the staff is going to be crucial to any organisation delivering services these types of services.   |
| Long-term financial planning                      | 7  | 1 | 3 | 3 | Depends how the financial relationship with any external organisation was set up; however, the expected contract length with a new external organisation would be at least a 5 year agreement, which allows long term financial planning. This can give confidence to borrow capital for investment in services, with a long enough period to recoup.   |
| Ability to commission effectively                 | 7  | 3 | 0 | 2 | A social enterprise would not primarily be a commissioning organisation.  |
| Increased leadership (governance) capacity        | 7  | 0 | 4 | 0 | Depends on the governance model and the quality of any external governance recruited. Positive examples exist where voluntary members are recruited to a management board and bring business links and opportunities that benefit the service.  |
| Be an attractive and responsible employer         | 10 | 5 | 3 | 4 | TUPE will ensure employees' T&Cs remain the same. Pensions advice will be required to understand pension options.   |
| Ability to engage effectively with other partners | 8  | 4 | 2 | 3 | It is clear that as council departments we are able to engage with other partners and have credibility when we do so as part of the council.  |
| Ability to engage the community                   | 10 | 2 | 3 | 0 | A Social Enterprise can make firm commitments to the local community to reinvest into Library/Archive services and to give the community a stake through membership, management and volunteering. A YouGov poll released in 2007 found that over 60% of the British public would prefer their local services to be run by a social enterprise instead of government, business or traditional charity. |

**Total                    325                    496                    325**